

**MCCALL AREA  
PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION  
MINUTES  
November 5, 2007  
Idaho First Bank Community Room**

---

- 1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL:** Chairman Robert Youde called the meeting to order at 6:01 pm. Commissioners Doug Russell, Claudia Delaney, Sarah Jessup, and Kim Apperson were present. Commissioners Phil Feinberg and Shane Jeffries were absent. A quorum was present.

City staff present were Michelle Groenevelt, Planning Manager, and Carol Coyle, Grant Coordinator/Asst. Planner.

Chairman Youde expressed the Commission's appreciation to Idaho First Bank and staff Greg Lovell, John Mansisor, and Chris Kirk for the use of the Community Room for the public hearings.

**2. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

The minutes of October 2, 2007 were reviewed. Claudia Delaney questioned the reference to the airport taxiway being lengthened; she said it that was actually was proposed to be moved further from the runway. She also said the reference to the environmental assessment would be required if the runway was moved for safety reasons, not the taxiway. Chairman Youde asked staff to confirm with airport staff to see if this was the case and make those changes.

Commissioner Russell moved to approve the minutes of October 2, 2007 with corrections as noted. Chairman Youde seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

**3. OLD BUSINESS**

**DR-07-54** (continued from the October 2, 2007 meeting)  
147 N. 3<sup>rd</sup> Street

Nathan Fuller representing Jim's Grocery: A design review application for new signs for the Sinclair gas station located at Jim's Grocery. The property is zoned Community Commercial and is more particularly described as:

McCall Acreage, Tax No. 35 in SENW, Section 16, T. 18N, R3E, City of McCall, Valley County Idaho. NOT A PUBLIC HEARING.

No one was present to speak on behalf of application. Chairman Youde suggested the application be tabled to next regular Planning and Zoning Commission meeting on Dec. 4<sup>th</sup>. Staff reported the applicant had been contacted prior to the meeting and had indicated that someone would attend tonight. Chairman Youde moved to continue the application to the Dec. 4<sup>th</sup> meeting; Commissioner Russell seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

**4. NEW BUSINESS:**

McCall Area Comprehensive Plan Amendment: The McCall Comprehensive Plan (adopted July 2000) has been revised with extensive public involvement to engage the McCall Community in the development of the McCall Area Comprehensive Plan update. The update includes significant revisions to the Goals and Objectives, Chapters, and Future Land Use Map. A PUBLIC HEARING.

Chairman Youde introduced public hearing for amendment to the McCall Area Comprehensive Plan. He described process that would be followed. There will be a staff presentation by a staff member of Otak, the City's consultant for the comprehensive plan update, followed by three separate motions that would include approval of the goals and objectives, the text and chapters, and the Future Land Use Plan (FLUP). Chairman Youde instructed the audience regarding the testimony procedure and reminded them of appropriate behavior during the public hearing period. He informed the audience that the public hearing process is a passive receipt process where testimony is listened to, but there is not debate or discussion with the testifiers. He indicated that the Commission will take testimony until 9 pm tonight, and then would continue the public hearing to 11/7/07 at 6 pm. After all public testimony is taken, the public hearing will be closed, and the Commissioners will discuss the three original motions, and any amendments to the original motions. He reminded the Commissioners are allowed and expected to recuse themselves from any of the motions where there may be a conflict of interest.

A brief recess was taken while Mandi Roberts from Otak arrived and set up presentation materials. At 6:17, Mandi began a power point presentation describing the purpose, process, and highlights of comprehensive plan update. A summary of the previous 15 months of work and community involvement was given, along with the major tasks associated with the update. A description of the various stakeholder meetings, community open house meetings, and steering committee meetings was given. The vision statement was given. She highlighted the areas of economic development, affordable housing, transportation, open space and parks, schools, public safety, and multimodal transportation.

Ms. Roberts explained the Future Land Use Plan and indicated that it was coordinated with currently adopted zoning. She described that new land use designations had been created and that impact area expansion that was based on community input. She also described the updated goals and objectives and indicated that handouts were available. She said that the themes of goals and objectives urged focus on local needs such as keeping the area green and scenic, promoting sustainability, having a complete community which is one that has everything it needs for a year round resident. Clustering concepts were considered to group development to promote open and green space and identify certain areas for development; linking areas together with bike paths and trails; planning for 3.5% average annual growth; based on the past years and average of a number of years.

The presentation concluded at 6:38 pm. Michelle Groenevelt informed audience of the availability of handouts and staff report along with goals and objectives and other materials for review. Ms. Groenevelt also mentioned that the FLUP showed new proposed impact area boundaries but clarified that the FLUP was only a proposal of future impact area. She indicated that the actual implementation of a new impact area would take negotiation between the Valley County Board of Commissioners and the McCall City Council, and that the Valley County Planning and Zoning Commission and the McCall Planning and Zoning Commission would be involved in the decision making process. She reiterated that the adoption of the FLUP would not change the existing impact area boundaries and would not change existing zoning.

Chairman Youde moved that the Commission approve the goals and objectives portion of the revised McCall Area Comprehensive Plan documents and forward the approval as a recommendation to the McCall City Council and the Valley County Board of Commissioners. Commissioner Jessup seconded the motion. Chairman Youde moved that the Commission approve the text and content of chapters 1-13 of the revised McCall Area Comprehensive Plan documents and forward it as a recommendation to the McCall City Council and the Valley County Board of Commissioners. Commissioner Russell seconded the motion. Chairman Youde moved that the Commission approve the Future Land Use Plan of the revised McCall Area Comprehensive Plan documents and forward the recommendation to the McCall City Council and the Valley County Board of Commissioners for approval. Commissioner Apperson seconded the motion. Chairman Youde mentioned that Commissioner Jeffries has asked to be recused from any deliberation or consideration of the Future Land Use Plan as he is employed by the United States Forest Service and there could be a perceived conflict of interest.

Chairman Youde opened the public hearing for the amendment to the McCall Area Comprehensive Plan at 6:44 pm and called for comment.

Diane Evans Mack, 235 Camp Lane, said overall she is pleased with the incorporation of public comment into the comprehensive plan. She agrees with goals and objectives, except in Chapter 3 Population, she recommended the wording "up to 3.5%" instead of just 3.5%. In Chapter 5, she would like to add "prohibit gated communities" on page 8. Regarding the general text, she said overall it looks good; but the comments on wildlife are a little "nebulous" and perhaps a wildlife biologist should be consulted for correct terminology. She also cautioned the Commission that state lands should be retained as open space and not be used for development.

Robert Blackman, 500 Brundage Drive, said he is new part-time resident. He said he had concerns regarding the Forest Service land on Mission/Mather. He said that houses on that land would be acceptable, but duplexes, triplexes, and apartments would negatively affect the area and would affect wildlife, the home owners, and the schools. He said is concerned about traffic congestion in and around school district buildings. He said increased traffic would create a dangerous intersection. He said that the parcel should not be designated as high density. He said that a high density designation would violate some of the goals and objectives in the comprehensive plan.

Kathy Blackman, 500 Brundage Drive, said she is a retired school teacher and has concerns about safety. She said she feels it is not a good idea to place a high density zoning area across from a high school and elementary school.

Peggy Bryan, 507 Brundage Drive, said she agrees with the goals and objectives of comprehensive plan. She believes the zoning map is inconsistent with the goals and objectives. She said she thinks that in "the 11<sup>th</sup> hour, ugly brown spots" were added. She suggested that reason it was done was because Commissioner Jeffries, who is employed by the USFS and is involved in selling the properties, was responsible for including high density sections on the FLUP. She said this was not the desire of the people who testified on the comprehensive plan. She said by designating the area as high density, it compromises the bargaining power of the Commission in the future when reviewing proposed developments. She pointed out that the FLUP high density designation contradicts goals and objectives in the comprehensive plan. She encouraged the Commission to disapprove FLUP and look at subtle changes that have been made in section R on page 43.

Bonnie (Fogg) Hathaway, 506 Brundage Drive, gave some history of the area near her home. She is concerned that duplexes have sprung up in the area and is concerned about how higher density would affect property values in the area. She said the neighborhood would be affected by additional housing. She suggested that management of R16 property is really important because sexual predators are hard to track in a high density area and that the area is close to elementary school.

Paula Durand, 513 Brundage Drive, gave the Commission a letter with three pages of signatures for the public record.

Cheryl Josephson, 515 Brundage Drive, said that she built a new house. She said she chose the location because of the surrounding open space. She said she built a modest house and had help from the neighborhood. She said it was not inexpensive to build. She said she is concerned about affordable and subsidized housing and feels that people should have to work and save their money to buy a house and should not get a handout. She feels affordable housing needs to be addressed in a different manner. She feels she already helps the Forest Service by paying taxes.

Larry Shake, 1612 So. Samson Trail, said that moving impact area to Johnson Lane and suggested changes to Hwy. 55 is a good idea. He said that the ability of the City of McCall to handle visual impact of coming to McCall is important and he said he wishes the County Commissioners would have the same idea. He is worried that the area from Donnelly to McCall will look like Fairview Ave. in Boise if it is not controlled. He also said he feels the Comprehensive Plan update has not dealt with the issue of the airport and given it its due diligence. He said he feels the impact of the airport will be the most important issue in the future. He feels the community needs to be involved with the airport and how it should deal with noise abatement, flight patterns, and that there is more comprehensive plan work to be done. He said he feels the issues surrounding the airport have been ignored by the comprehensive planners.

Glen Harsh, 1676 Brooklawn, said he is concerned about the proposed cluster village overlay in Bear Basin area and is wondering how cluster village will work on 10 acre parcels in area. He also mentioned that no sewer is available in the area. He understands a village as having a bakery, pizza place, and gas station and other commercial services and he said that would be inappropriate in the Bear Basin area. He said he would like to hear discussion about how this would work in a practical sense.

Brigid Wiking, 129 Sue Drive, asked a question about the deletion of gated communities prohibition language. She brought up history of Whitetail subdivision and public reaction to gated communities during that subdivision approval. She questioned why and how that wording was deleted.

Henry Clouser, 190 Rio Vista, spoke in reference to R16 designation and said he thinks it is feasible but has to be done properly. He said that he lives near an R16 zoned property, and that property has become jammed with units and cars. He said he feels R16 was thought up without any consideration as to what it really means. He said it needs stringent rules and would hate to see what has happened around his property to happen elsewhere.

David Mathis, 305 Hill Road said he is opposed to the designation on the map for the Forest Service property. He said he doesn't feel anyone from City or the Commission should be able

to designate government land and that it should require an EIS. He said rezoning it is inappropriate and it is inappropriate for the Board to be considering it.

The Commission took an informal recess at 7:19 pm. Chairman Youde reconvened the public hearing at 7:35 pm.


Brian O'Morrow, 1195 S. Samson Trail, said in general he is pleased with the comprehensive plan goals and objectives and future land use map. He said he wanted to bring up the Samson Trail/Elo Road corner which was added by public comment tonight and urged the Commission to consider that parcel. He said the Steering Committee, of which he was a member, had discussed village clustering north of Elo Road. He said care should be taken not to increase the density too much as it leads to infill. He said the property it is very open and visible and potentially could have commercial use as it is on a corner. He encouraged the Commission to keep that area RE designation.

Bill Shortley, 300 McBride Street, said has been here one month. He is from the Los Angeles area. He said it is important to manage R16 properties. He said he was aware of a particular development that had a buffer zone between R16 and R8 and it had sufficient parking and that made it more acceptable to the residents. He also mentioned that he lived in an area where there was an R16 development near him and the parking was not sufficient.

Linda Shortley, 300 McBride Street, said that whenever there is high density designation there are multiple adults with multiple cars and parking is a very big issue and often there is not sufficient parking. She also said clustering higher density and lower density can work. She emphasized that a buffer zone is helpful.

Larry Shake, 1612 S. Samson Trail, said he also wanted to bring up urban fire interface and defensible communities, and suggested the Commission include looking at how to protect homes from wildfire. He said it should be mentioned in the comprehensive plan.

Hearing no other comment, Chairman Youde called for a recess and continued the public hearing until 6 pm on 11/7/07. The meeting was adjourned at 7:45 pm.



---

Robert Youde, Chairman  
Planning & Zoning Commission

**ATTEST:**



---

Carol Coyle  
Grants Coordinator/Asst. Planner